

Jeremy Yencer - Lesley University

DigitalCommons@Lesley

Full report accessible here: "The Real Truth About Popular Mindfulness Apps: Mindfulness or Market S" by Jeremy T. Yencer"

- Date of Award - 1-2026
- Document Type - Thesis
- Degree Name - MA - Master of Arts
- Department - Mindfulness Studies
- First Advisor - Yasemin Isler
- Second Advisor - Cacky Mellor

Abstract

The rapid expansion of mindfulness applications raises important questions about their authenticity. A central concern is whether these digital interventions are primarily motivated by genuine mindfulness education or by commercial interests seeking to maximize commercial metrics. This thesis addresses this issue by comprehensively assessing these applications against established ethical and educational standards. The study introduces the Alaya conceptual model, a novel evaluative framework that adapts the six domains of the MBI:TAC and incorporates two additional domains focused on commercial integrity, governance, and ethics. The Alaya framework utilizes a deterministic scoring mechanism to evaluate the integrity of digital applications, specifically their adherence to mindfulness principles, transparency, and user data protection. The findings offer critical transparency for users and establish a benchmark for developers to ensure that digital delivery methods align with the fundamental, non-commercial principles of mindfulness.

Summary

This thesis investigates a central tension in the booming mindfulness app industry: **Are these apps genuinely teaching mindfulness, or are they primarily engineered for commercial success?** Drawing on extensive literature across populations; students, children, educators, veterans, workplaces, and general users, the study shows that while mindfulness apps often produce **short-term improvements** in stress, mood, sleep, and emotional regulation, they frequently lack the **pedagogical depth**, **ethical grounding**, and **relational qualities** that define evidence-based mindfulness teaching.

A key issue is **pedagogical fidelity**. Traditional programs such as MBSR and MBCT rely on experiential learning, teacher embodiment, inquiry, ethics, and structured curricula. These are assessed through the **Mindfulness-Based Interventions: Teaching Assessment Criteria (MBI:TAC)**. Most commercial apps do not meet these standards. They often prioritise **engagement features**, streaks, gamification, push notifications, premium tiers, that reflect market incentives rather than contemplative integrity. This commercial logic risks reframing mindfulness as a consumable wellness product rather than a transformative practice.

The thesis identifies further concerns: declining engagement after initial novelty, developmental inappropriateness in children's apps, trauma-insensitive design for veterans and clinical users, and the growing influence of AI systems that may optimise for retention rather than wellbeing. These issues highlight a gap in the field: **no existing framework evaluates digital mindfulness tools with the same rigour applied to in-person teaching**.

To address this, the thesis introduces **Alaya**, a new conceptual and evaluative model. Alaya adapts the six MBI:TAC domains for digital contexts and adds two new domains focused on **commercial integrity**, **governance**, and **ethical transparency**. It uses a **deterministic scoring system** to assess whether an app aligns with mindfulness principles, protects user data, avoids manipulative design, and maintains pedagogical authenticity. Alaya is both a critique of current market practices and a constructive tool for guiding future digital mindfulness development.

The study concludes that while mindfulness apps can be beneficial, **effectiveness alone does not equal authenticity**. The future of digital mindfulness requires clear standards, ethical governance, trauma-sensitive design, and frameworks like Alaya to ensure that digital delivery remains aligned with the foundational intentions of mindfulness.

Comparison Table: MBI:TAC vs. Alaya

Dimension	MBI:TAC	Alaya
Purpose	Assess competence of live mindfulness teachers in MBSR/MBCT settings	Evaluate digital mindfulness apps for pedagogical, ethical, and commercial integrity
Context	Human-to-human, relational, experiential teaching	App-based, AI-mediated, commercially driven environments
Core Domains	6 domains: Coverage & curriculum, Relational skills, Embodiment, Guiding practice, Inquiry, Conveying themes	Adapts all 6 MBI:TAC domains for digital use
Additional Domains	None	2 new domains: Commercial Integrity and Governance & Ethics
Focus on Embodiment	Central — teacher presence and modelling are essential	Evaluates how apps approximate or compensate for the absence of embodiment
Inquiry	Live, relational, co-created dialogue	Assesses whether apps offer reflective scaffolding without simulating false relationality
Ethics	Implicit within teacher training and curriculum	Explicitly evaluated: transparency, data protection, AI safeguards, non-manipulative design
Assessment Method	Qualitative, developmental, assessor-led	Deterministic scoring system for consistency and transparency
Primary Risks Addressed	Teacher competence, safety, fidelity to curriculum	Commercialisation, algorithmic manipulation, trauma-insensitive design, pedagogical dilution
Intended Users	Teachers, trainers, supervisors	Developers, researchers, consumers, regulators